

Table of Contents

| | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| About the Author | v |
| Foreword | xiii |
| Preface | xv |
| Introduction | 1 |
| CHAPTER 1 | |
| The Relationship between the Rule of Reason, the Standard of Reasonableness and Proportionality in Search of Fairness | 9 |
| 1.1 The Origins of the Standard of Reasonableness, the Rule of Reason, and the Principle of Proportionality | 9 |
| 1.2 Their Interaction, Differentiation, and Classification as Rules, Standards or Principles | 11 |
| 1.3 Their General Importance to Fundamental Tax Principles and Issues (Equality, Legal Certainty, Tax Avoidance, Effectiveness, International Double Taxation) in Search of Fairness: What Is Tax Fairness | 16 |
| CHAPTER 2 | |
| American Legislation and the US Supreme Court | 25 |
| 2.1 The Constitutional Clauses regarding Reasonableness and Proportionality Standards of Review | 26 |
| 2.1.1 The Role of Proportionality in the American Federalism | 26 |
| 2.1.2 Constitutional Clause on Contract Protection (The Rule of Reason) | 30 |
| 2.1.3 Reasonableness and Legal Interpretation | 33 |
| 2.1.4 The Living Notion of Reasonableness and Proportionality | 34 |

Table of Contents

| | | | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|----|
| 2.2 | Excessive Taxation | 35 | |
| 2.3 | Tax Discrimination | 37 | |
| 2.4 | Retrospective Taxation | 42 | |
| 2.5 | Domestic Notions of Reasonableness and Proportionality and Their International Tax Dimension | 44 | |
| CHAPTER 3 | | | |
| International Jurisdictions and Proportionality and Reasonable Standards of Review (The ICJ, the ECHR and the WTO) | | | 49 |
| 3.1 | The Role of Proportionality within the Jurisdiction of the <i>International Court of Justice</i> | 50 | |
| 3.2 | The <i>European Court of Human Rights</i> : Proportionality and Reasonableness Tests in Tax Matters and in General | 52 | |
| 3.2.1 | General Principles and the Origin of Proportionality and Reasonable Standards of Review in the ECHR | 52 | |
| 3.2.2 | The Meaning and Ascertainment of Reasonableness via Proportionality | 53 | |
| 3.2.3 | Reasonableness and Proportionality as an Unwritten and Overarching Principle | 55 | |
| a) | Discrimination: Reasonableness Coupled with Proportionality | 55 | |
| b) | The Right to Property, Its Three Rules and the Overall Assessment of Proportionality | 57 | |
| c) | Proportionality and Other Fundamental Rights | 60 | |
| 1) | Express Limited Rights | 60 | |
| 2) | The Rights to a Fair Trial and to an Effective Remedy | 61 | |
| 3) | Absolute Rights and Implied Limitations | 63 | |
| d) | Conclusion | 65 | |
| 3.2.4 | The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine and Its Interference with the Proportionality Principle | 66 | |
| a) | Tax and Non-tax Matters, Notion of the Margin of Appreciation | 66 | |
| b) | The Margin of Appreciation in Taxation | 70 | |
| 3.2.5 | Tax Discrimination | 71 | |
| a) | The Joint Taxation of Married Couples and Family Taxation | 71 | |
| b) | Tax Discrimination on Grounds of Sex and Strict Proportionality | 75 | |
| c) | Tax Discrimination on Grounds of Fiscal Residence | 78 | |
| 3.2.6 | Justification for Retrospective Taxation | 79 | |
| a) | Retrospective Legislation, Tax Avoidance, and Tax Evasion | 79 | |

| | | | |
|------------------------------------------------------|-------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| | b) | Contrast between Tax and Non-tax Retrospective Legislation | 83 |
| | c) | Some Conclusions on Retrospective Legislation and Proportionality | 86 |
| | 3.2.7 | Other Tax Principles Derived from Proportionality | 87 |
| | a) | Lawfulness (Clarity and Predictability) in Taxation | 87 |
| | b) | Fiscal Penalties and Forfeiture | 89 |
| | c) | Excessive Taxation, and Ability to Pay ('Financial Position') | 94 |
| | d) | VAT and the Rights to Deduction and Refund | 96 |
| | 3.2.8 | Conclusion on the ECHR | 97 |
| 3.3 | | The WTO: The Interaction between the Rules and Principles of International Free Trade, Taxation and the Role of the Proportionality Principle | 100 |
| | 3.3.1 | The Core Principle of Non-discrimination within the WTO | 100 |
| | 3.3.2 | National Treatment Principle and Other GATT/GATS Rules | 103 |
| | a) | The Principle of Non-discrimination | 103 |
| | b) | The General Exceptions, the Wording 'Necessary': The Cost-Benefit Analysis and Proportionality | 105 |
| | c) | Chapeau of Articles XX and XIV: Balance and Non-abuse of Rights | 110 |
| | 3.3.3 | Contrast with Other Jurisdictions and Conclusion | 117 |
| | | | |
| CHAPTER 4 | | | |
| A European Union Law (The European Court of Justice) | | | |
| | | | 121 |
| 4.1 | | Proportionality as a General Principle of EU Law | 122 |
| 4.2 | | Proportionality, Taxation, and the Fundamental Freedom of Goods | 125 |
| | 4.2.1 | Custom Duties (Articles 28-30 TFEU) | 125 |
| | 4.2.2 | Trade Restrictions on Imports and the Rule of Reason (Articles 34-36 TFEU) | 126 |
| | 4.2.3 | The Relationship between State Aid and the Freedom of Movement of Goods (Articles 34-36 Rule of Reason and 107 TFEU) | 128 |
| | 4.2.4 | Domestic Taxation and Protective Measures (Articles 110-113 TFEU) | 130 |
| 4.3 | | Free Movement of Persons, Services and Capital (Proportionality as an Explicit Condition for Any Restrictive Measure) | 132 |
| 4.4 | | Interaction between Environmental Taxation and the Fundamental Freedoms | 138 |
| 4.5 | | Proportionality and Tax Imperative Requirements (Fiscal Coherence, Effectiveness of Fiscal Supervision, Balanced Allocation of Taxing Powers and Tax Avoidance) | 142 |
| | 4.5.1 | The Tax System Coherence as a Justification | 142 |

Table of Contents

| | | |
|------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| | 4.5.2 The Fiscal Supervision Requirement | 145 |
| | 4.5.3 The Allocation of Tax Powers between Member States | 147 |
| 4.6 | Proportionality, Abuse and Tax Avoidance | 151 |
| | 4.6.1 The Role of Proportionality in Addressing Tax Avoidance | 151 |
| | 4.6.2 Development of a General Doctrine of Abuse of Rights (Direct Taxation) | 153 |
| | 4.6.3 Specific Tax Avoidance Rules and Proportionality | 159 |
| 4.7 | VAT Principles and Proportionality | 161 |
| | 4.7.1 Tax Avoidance, Tax Evasion, Simplification, Neutrality and Fairness (Substantive Measures) | 161 |
| | 4.7.2 Abuse of Rights as a General Anti-avoidance Rule within the VAT System | 166 |
| | 4.7.3 Fiscal Supervision, Fraud, Neutrality, Fairness (Procedural Measures) | 169 |
| | 4.7.4 Conclusions on VAT Principles and Proportionality | 172 |
| 4.8 | Retrospective Tax Legislation, Legitimate Expectation, and Proportionality | 173 |
| | 4.8.1 The Principles of Legal Certainty and Its Corollary of Legitimate Expectation | 173 |
| | 4.8.2 Proportionality, Legitimate Expectation and Retrospective Legislation in General | 175 |
| | 4.8.3 Actual Retrospective Taxation. Simplification as a Justification | 177 |
| | 4.8.4 Retrospective Taxation and Justifications of Tax Avoidance, Abuse and Evasion: Actual and Apparent Retrospective Taxation | 178 |
| | 4.8.5 Retrospective Taxation and Procedural Rules regarding Limitation Periods | 181 |
| 4.9 | Conclusion on the EU and Some Comparisons with Other Jurisdictions | 183 |
| Conclusion | | 187 |
| 1 | Proportionality and Reasonableness as Overarching or General International Principles or Standards of Law | 187 |
| 2 | Fundamental Tax Issues and the Role of Proportionality and Reasonableness | 190 |
| | 2.1 Equality, Non-discrimination and International Tax Law | 190 |
| | 2.2 The Abuse of Tax Law and Other International Tax Principles Developed via Proportionality and Reasonableness | 193 |
| | 2.3 The Features of Proportionality (Optimization, Effectiveness and Neutrality) and the Principle of Good Faith in Assessing Fair Taxation | 196 |
| | 2.4 Proportionality and Reasonableness as Applied to Double Taxation Conventions | 199 |
| 3 | Costs and Benefits of Proportionality: International Tax Certainty and Fairness | 201 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|----------------|-----|
| Bibliography | 205 |
| Table of Cases | 217 |
| Index | 231 |