CONTENTS

Editors’ Foreword .................................................................................. V

Chapter 1
Transitional Justice: Lessons from South Africa?
Catherine Jenkins ................................................................. 1

1. Introduction .................................................................................. 1
2. South Africa: A Transition from What? ........................................... 4
   2.1. The ‘Deep Wounds’ of Colonialism ........................................... 5
   2.2. Apartheid ............................................................................. 10
3. The Post-Apartheid Project: A Transition to What? ......................... 18
   3.1. Transformation .................................................................. 19
   3.2. Nation-Building .................................................................. 22
4. Role of Law, Courts and Lawyers in the South African Transition .... 26
5. Conclusion ................................................................................... 36

Chapter 2
Reflections on Post-Apartheid Nation-Building: Identity, Participation,
Community
Gerhard Maré ................................................................................. 41

1. Introduction: The Struggle for What? .............................................. 41
2. The Legacy of Apartheid: Nations, Space, Race and Capitalism ......... 45
   2.1. Nations ............................................................................ 46
   2.2. Space ............................................................................. 50
   2.3. Race ............................................................................... 54
   2.4. Capitalism ....................................................................... 55
   3.1. Democracy: The Necessity of Debate and Protection of the
        Communicative Space ........................................................... 57
4. Conclusion: Democracy and Uncertainty ......................................... 61
Chapter 3
The Truth and Reconciliation Commission Process: A Retrospective
John Daniel

1. Introduction 65
2. The Party Political Critique 68
3. The Academic Critique: Misperception of the Genre 70
4. The Case for the Commission 76
5. The Truth 79
6. Amnesty 83
7. The Political Demobilization of the Right-Wing 84
8. The Grand Narrative of Reconciliation 86
9. But Can it Last? The Missing Material Dimension 87
10. Conclusion 88

Chapter 4
Rights at Work: The Transition to Constitutional Democracy and Women in South Africa
Catherine Albertyn

1. Introduction 91
2. Race, Class and Gender under Apartheid 92
3. Establishing Constitutional Democracy and Women’s Rights 95
4. Culture, Equality and Rights 103
5. Rights, Choice and What’s Good for Women 112
   5.1. Using Rights Strategies against Abortion 115
   5.2. Rights: Sites of Contestation 118
6. Conclusion 120

Chapter 5
Crime, Policing and Nation-Building
Antony Albekker

1. ‘Kill the Bastards’ 123
2. Crime, the Beloved Country 125
3. Crime, the Law and Institutionalised Cynicism 128
4. Unequal Protection 130
5. The Idea of the Law after the ‘Democratic Breakthrough’ 132
6. Law Enforcement after Apartheid 133
7. Shabangu and the Rule of Law 137
Chapter 6
Public Schools for Afrikaners in South Africa
Christina Murray .................................................. 139

1. Introduction .................................................. 139
2. Settling the Language of Education Provision .......... 141
3. The Law and Policy Framework ............................. 147
3.1. The Broad Context: Resources, the Constitution and Politics ...... 147
3.2. Law and Policy ........................................... 152
4. What is Happening in the Schools .......................... 155
4.1. Statistics and Choices ................................... 156
4.2. Race and Administrative Procedures .................... 158
5. Assessing the Settlement ..................................... 161
5.1. Using Rights ............................................. 162
5.2. Multilevel Government ................................... 165
5.3. School Governing Bodies ................................. 166
5.4. National Politicians ...................................... 167
6. Conclusion .................................................... 168

Chapter 7
Behind the Mask of the Rainbow Nation: The Limits of Law in Post-Apartheid South Africa
Stephen Peté and Max du Plessis ................................ 169

1. Introduction ................................................... 169
2. The Origins of the CLS Movement – Historical Parallels between the United States of America and South Africa ................................................. 170
3. Dreams of a Rainbow Nation .................................. 173
4. A Discourse of Rising Discontent .......................... 177
5. Failing to Implement the Law [1]: Fighting for Scraps in the Battle for Pensions and Social Grants .......................................................... 185
6. Failing to Obey Court Orders [2]: Executive Intransigence and AIDS .. 189
7. Conclusion ....................................................... 196

Chapter 8
The Transformation of the Judiciary
Murray Wesson and Gilbert Marcus .................................. 199

1. Introduction .................................................... 199
2. The Judiciary under Apartheid ............................... 201
3. The Transformation of the Judiciary: What Does it Mean? ........... 203
3.1. The Process by which Judges are Appointed ............... 204
3.2. Diversity .................................................... 206
3.3. Judicial Attitudes .......................................................... 211
3.4. Accountability and Ethics .............................................. 213
3.5. Efficiency and Access to Justice ...................................... 218
4. Conclusion ........................................................................ 221

Chapter 9
Assessing the Social Transformation Performance of the South African Constitutional Court: From Totalitarianism to the Rule of Law
Theunis Roux ................................................................. 223
1. Introduction ..................................................................... 223
2. The Four Adjudicative Strategies ...................................... 228
   2.1. The Use of Doctrinally Redundant Language to Set the Tone
        of a Judgment ............................................................ 228
   2.2. A Preference for Formalistic Tests over Substantive Moral
        Reasoning ................................................................. 231
   2.3. The Conversion of Conceptual Tests into Discretionary Standards 233
   2.4. Manipulating Textual Ambiguity So As to Lower the Political
        Temperature in Controversial Cases .............................. 236
3. Conclusion ....................................................................... 240

Chapter 10
The Transformation of Land Law
A.J. van der Walt .......................................................... 241
1. Introduction ..................................................................... 241
2. Transformation, Legal Culture and Tradition ..................... 246
3. Transforming Land Law .................................................... 249

Chapter 11
The South African Presidency in Comparative African Context
Roger Southall ................................................................. 257
1. Introduction ..................................................................... 257
2. The Presidency Under Apartheid ...................................... 260
3. The Presidency Since 1994 ................................................. 263
4. The Two Term Limit and the ANC .................................... 272
5. One or Two Centres of Power? Party, Parliament and President in
   the Wake of Polokwane .................................................. 275
7. Conclusion: The Presidency and Democracy ....................... 280
Chapter 12
Aspects of the Treatment of Freedom of Expression in South Africa’s Democratic Transition
Glenn Penfold  ................................................................. 281

1. Introduction ................................................................. 281
2. The Vital Role of Freedom of Expression in Promoting Democratic Functioning ......................................................... 284
3. Defamation .............................................................................. 287
   3.1. Out Goes Strict Liability, in Comes Reasonableness .......... 290
   3.2. The Onus of Proof .......................................................... 294
4. Contempt of Court ............................................................. 296
5. Hate Speech .......................................................................... 299
   5.1. The Treatment of Hate Speech in the Constitution ....... 299
   5.2. Legislative Prohibitions on Hate Speech ......................... 302
   5.3. The Treatment of Constitutional Hate Speech in Tribunals and Courts ................................................................. 305
6. Conclusion ........................................................................... 310

Chapter 13
Constitutionalism in Commonwealth Africa: Comparative Perspectives
Peter Slinn ................................................................. 313

1. Introduction .......................................................................... 313
2. The Rule of Law and Constitutionalism ............................... 318
3. Constitutions Do Matter: The Revival of Constitutionalism .... 319
4. Political Culture ................................................................. 321
5. Historical Legacy: Colonial and Post-Colonial ....................... 322
6. The Search for Popular and Durable Constitutions ............... 324
7. Excessive Concentration of Power in the Executive .............. 325
8. Lack of Parliamentary Autonomy and Effective Political Accountability ................................................................. 326
9. Threats to the Independence and Integrity of the Judiciary .... 328
10. The Failure to Develop Effective Methods of Devolution of Power to Local Communities ................................................................. 329
11. Undermining the Constitution by ‘Constitutional’ and ‘Extra-Constitutional’ Means ................................................................. 330
12. Weakness of Civil Society and Lack of Effective Independent Oversight Institutions ................................................................. 331
13. Conclusion: Some Comparative Pointers for South Africa .... 332