

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Table of Constitutional Provisions</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xxvii</i>

INTRODUCTION: THE ELUSIVE JURISPRUDENCE OF CHURCH AND STATE I

The Constitutional Informality of the Church–State Alliance	4
From Domination to Separation: The Flexibility of the Constitutional Framework	6
The Secular Evolution of the Constitutional Order	11
Themes and Principles	15

CHAPTER I: THE EVOLVING STATUS OF RELIGION IN THE CONSTITUTIONAL ORDER 19

Introduction	19
I. Religion and Constitutional Identity in Independent Ireland	20
II. The Influence of Religion in the Drafting of the Constitution	28
III. Religion as an Interpretive Resource in Constitutional Adjudication	33
IV. The Secularisation of Constitutional Adjudication and Constitutional Discourse	41
<i>Constitutional Interpretation and Public Philosophy after Natural Law</i>	47

Introduction	51
I. The Theoretical Bases of Religious Freedom	53
II. Defining Religious Freedom in Law: Analytical and Conceptual Dilemmas	60
<i>Objections to the “Neutrality” Approach</i>	66
III. Statutory Exemptions for Religious Practices: Theoretical and Practical Obstacles	70
<i>Exemptions, Fairness and Institutional Competence</i>	71
IV. The Embryonic Irish Jurisprudence on Religious Freedom	82
<i>The Constitutional Provisions and Case Law: An Inchoate Imperative of Exemption</i>	84
<i>Ambiguities and Lacunae in the Quinn’s Supermarket Doctrine</i>	88
V. Exploring Potential Uses of Religious Freedom in Irish Law	95
<i>Current Controversies</i>	95
<i>Before Exemptions, Neutrality?</i>	99
VI. Defining the Spheres of Protected Activity and Belief	103
<i>A Minimal Benchmark of “Equal Liberty”?</i>	103
<i>Defining Statutory “Neutrality”</i>	105
<i>Religious Freedom and Secular Purpose in Legislation</i>	109
<i>Religious Freedom Beyond “Neutrality”</i>	111
<i>Deciding what “Religion” Means</i>	115
<i>The Limited Scope of Freedom of Conscience</i>	121
<i>Religious Freedom and Positive State Obligations</i>	128

Introduction	131
I. The Primacy of Religious Freedom over Non-discrimination: The Genesis of the Doctrine	134
II. The Conceptual Dichotomy of Religious Freedom and Non-discrimination in the School Enrolment Context	141
<i>Religious Discrimination as Interference in Religious Freedom</i>	149

	<i>Discrimination, Religious Freedom and Non-domination</i>	152
III.	Religious Discrimination in Employment	165
IV.	Religious Discrimination across Public and Private Spheres	172
	<i>Constitutional Equality Law at the “Epicentre” of Religious Life: The “Indicia of Secularity” Approach</i>	180
	<i>Adapting the “Indicia of Secularity” Test to Irish Law</i>	192
CHAPTER 4: RELIGIOUS FREEDOM UNDER THE PATRONAGE MODEL IN IRISH EDUCATION		195
<hr/>		
	Introduction: The Controversial Parameters of Religious Freedom in Education	195
I.	The Patronage Model: Historical Context and Constitutional Framework	201
	<i>Religious Freedom under the Patronage Model: The Implications of the “Integrated Curriculum” Policy</i>	208
II.	The Constitution and the Integrated Curriculum: A “Right” to Denominational Education?	216
	<i>A Conflict of Religious Freedom Claims in the Campaign Case</i>	220
III.	Exploring the “Balance” of Religious Freedom Rights in Education	224
	<i>Communitarianism and Religious Freedom: The Constitutional Conception of Religious Education as a Public Good</i>	228
	<i>Utility, Educational Consumers and School “Choice”</i>	235
	<i>Locating the New Politics of School Choice</i>	246
	<i>The Dubious Attribution of School “Choice”</i>	249
	Conclusion	252
CHAPTER 5: INEQUALITY, POWER AND SCHOOL CHOICE: RELIGION AND THE PATRONAGE MODEL		253
<hr/>		
	Introduction: Pluralist School Recognition as a Limited Instrument of Religious Freedom	253
	<i>Interpreting Educational Pluralism in the Constitution: A Qualified Right to School Recognition</i>	256

I. The Limited Scope of “Pluralism” under the Patronage Model	260
II. Formal Neutrality and School Recognition: The Uneven Distribution of School “Choice”	266
<i>School Choice, Patronage and Power Relations: Protestant Secondary Schools as a Case Study</i>	274
<i>Inequality and Religious Freedom under the Patronage Model: A Synopsis</i>	281
III. Pluralising the Patronage Model: The Limited Horizons of Reform	284
<i>Religious Education in Community National Schools: A New Departure?</i>	291
<i>Religious Instruction in Publicly Administered Schools: Perspectives from United States Constitutional Law</i>	296
<i>Religious Exercises in Publicly Administered Schools in the Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights</i>	301

CHAPTER 6: THE CONSTITUTIONAL SEPARATION OF CHURCH
AND STATE: PROHIBITIONS ON THE ESTABLISHMENT AND
ENDOWMENT OF RELIGION 313

Introduction	313
I. Endowment of Religion in the Context of Education: The Significance of the <i>Campaign</i> Decision	320
II. Criticisms of the <i>Campaign</i> Ruling	324
<i>Dubious Invocations of “Private Choice”</i>	324
<i>Historical Intentions in Constitutional Interpretation</i>	328
<i>The Broad Literal Scope of “Endowment”</i>	330
<i>Non-endowment and the Constitutional Value of Religion</i>	332
III. Religious Freedom, Equality and Church–State Separation: A Purposive Interpretation of the Endowment Clause	335
<i>A Purposive Jurisprudence of Church–State Separation</i>	335
<i>Religious Freedom and Separationism in American Jurisprudence</i>	337
<i>Arguments for a Purposive Jurisprudence of the Endowment Clause</i>	342
<i>Sectarian Strife, Divisiveness and Non-endowment</i>	346
IV. In Search of an Endowment Clause Doctrine: Comparative Jurisprudence	351

<i>The Insufficiency of Formal Neutrality in State Support of Religions</i>	354
<i>The Shift from Lemon Separationism to Formal Neutrality in the US Jurisprudence</i>	358
<i>Non-endowment in the French Law of Separation of Churches and State 1905</i>	365
V. The Constitutionality of the Congregational Indemnity Agreement 2002	370
CHAPTER 7: LEGISLATIVE INTERVENTION IN RELIGIOUS FUNCTION: EXPLORING THE CONSTITUTIONAL VALUE OF DENOMINATIONAL AUTONOMY	381
<hr/>	
Introduction	381
I. Denominational Autonomy as a Constitutional Value: Some Conceptual Ambiguities	384
II. A Legislative “Buttress” for Religious Function: The Incongruity of the Mass Cards Law	391
III. Comparative Jurisprudence on Legislative “Neutrality” and Religious Function	395
IV. The Dubious Constitutionality of the “Mass Cards” Law	399
<i>Religious Freedom and Legislative Intervention in Religious Function</i>	399
<i>Religious Discrimination and Legislative Intervention in Religious Function</i>	410
<i>Legislative Intervention in Religious Function and the Constitutional Principle of Denominational Autonomy</i>	417
V. Between Neutrality and Recognition: Legislative Intervention in Religion and the Concept of Religious Freedom in Irish Law	421
Conclusion	428

CHAPTER 8: BLASPHEMY AND IRISH LAW	429
------------------------------------	-----

<hr/>	
Introduction	429
I. The Liberal Interpretation of Constitutional Blasphemy Law in the <i>Corway</i> Judgment	432

<i>The Unconstitutionality of Common Law Blasphemy</i>	434
<i>Blasphemy and Constitutional Interpretation</i>	439
II. The Pluralisation of Blasphemy Law in the Defamation Act 2009	441
<i>Anomalies in the Religiously Plural Blasphemy Offence</i>	444
<i>Establishing Religious “Outrage” in a Framework of Religious Neutrality: Judicial Dilemmas</i>	449