

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|------|
| <i>Acknowledgment</i> | vii |
| <i>Foreword by Francesco Francioni</i> | xiii |
| 1. Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1. WTO-governed international trade, the pursuit of 'non-trade' policies, and a case study on the impact of GATT and GATS on cultural protection and education provision | 2 |
| 1.2. Adding the perspective of international human rights obligations. | 8 |
| 1.3. Existing GATT/S legal avenues to address culture and education- related human rights concerns, and their limits. | 16 |
| 1.4. Remarks on approach and methodology | 18 |
| 2. The impact of international trade on 'non-trade' and 'non-economic' values and the case of GATT/S trade in culture and education | 25 |
| 2.1. Introduction | 25 |
| 2.2. Contextual background: International trade liberalisation theory and the pursuit of 'non-trade'/'non-economic' values | 27 |
| 2.2.1. Grasping the complex impact of trade liberalisation on the legal protection of 'non-trade'/'non-economic' values: The need for nuance | 28 |
| 2.2.2. Freer trade proponents' responses to claims about trade impact, and their limits from a non-trade/non-economic legal viewpoint | 32 |
| 2.3. WTO trade in cultural and educational goods and services: legal framework | 36 |
| 2.3.1. The place of culture and education in WTO law, particularly in GATT and GATS law, and in ongoing trade negotiations | 38 |
| 2.3.2. The wider (WTO and international) interpretational setting of trade in cultural and educational goods and services. | 47 |
| 2.4. The GATT/S impact on cultural protection and education provision: characterising, contextualising and uniting two parallel discourses | 53 |
| 2.4.1. GATT/S impact on cultural protection: A closer look | 54 |
| 2.4.2. GATT/S impact on education provision: A closer look. | 61 |
| 2.4.2.1. Debates about the GATT/S impact on education | 62 |

- 2.4.2.2. Education related EC (case) law: An illustration of GATS issues ahead? 65
 - 2.4.2.2.1. The relevance of EC legal practice to WTO focused analysis 65
 - 2.4.2.2.2. Pointing at ambiguities in the legal characterisation of education provision in EC (case) law..... 67
- 2.4.3. Beyond polarisation: outstanding structural issues in assessing the GATT/S impact on cultural protection and education provision, and the case for their parallel pursuit in a GATT/S context..... 73
- 3. Connecting international human rights law to WTO law: towards an assessment framework 83
 - 3.1. Introduction 83
 - 3.2. The nature of international human rights law 85
 - 3.2.1. Rights and rights holders in international human rights law 86
 - 3.2.2. Obligations and obligations holders in international human rights law..... 89
 - 3.3. Human rights law from a WTO law viewpoint: role and relevance of the non-WTO law of international human rights in WTO Dispute Settlement 98
 - 3.4. WTO law and practice from a human rights law viewpoint 110
 - 3.4.1. An international (human rights) law framework to address the human rights/WTO law puzzle 111
 - 3.4.2. Legal and policy consequences of international human rights law for GATT/S law and practice 124
- 4. Applying the human rights/WTO law assessment framework to GATT/S trade in culture and education..... 133
 - 4.1. Introduction 133
 - 4.2. Culture related substantive human rights concerns raised by GATT/S trade in cultural goods and services..... 135
 - 4.3. Education related substantive human rights concerns raised by GATT/S trade in educational goods and services..... 149
 - 4.4. The case for merging legitimate concerns about GATT/S law into 'right to education' and 'rights in education' arguments..... 161

- 5. Exploring existing WTO law provisions for addressing human rights concerns: the case of trade in culture and education..... 163
 - 5.1. Introduction 163
 - 5.2. GATS carve-out for 'services supplied in the exercise of governmental authority' and human rights concerns raised by trade in culture and education: a wider reading..... 165
 - 5.3. GATT/S general exception clauses and culture and education related human rights concerns 176
 - 5.3.1. Wording and nature of Article XX GATT/Article XIV GATS... 178
 - 5.3.2. The application of the general exception clauses 179
 - 5.3.3. Provisional justification: Listed exception grounds common to the GATT and GATS General Exceptions 180
 - 5.3.3.1. Exception grounds common to GATT and GATS General Exceptions 181
 - 5.3.3.1.1. Article XX(a) GATT/Article XIV(a) GATS (necessity to protect public morals, or to maintain public order): A false dawn 181
 - 5.3.3.1.2. Article XX(d) GATT/Article XIV(c) GATS: Necessity to secure compliance with laws or regulations not inconsistent with GATT/S..... 183
 - 5.3.3.2. Exception grounds specific to GATT General Exceptions..... 185
 - 5.3.3.2.1. Article XX (e) GATT: Re-reading the wording of measures relating to 'the products of prison labour' 185
 - 5.3.3.2.2. Article XX (f) GATT: Measures imposed for the protection of national treasures of artistic, historic or archaeological value 189
 - 5.3.3.3. The application of the specific requirements of "necessary" and "relating to" in the general exception clauses 190
 - 5.3.4. Further appraisal: the requirements of the general exceptions' chapeau clause..... 193
- 6. Overcoming further obstacles to integrating human rights in WTO law and WTO dispute settlement 197
 - 6.1. Introduction 197

| | |
|--|-----|
| 6.2. Understanding and overcoming conceptual barriers: implications of conceptually diverging uses of the language of 'human rights' in the WTO law context | 198 |
| 6.2.1. Facing 'friendly fire': Confronting international labour lawyers' pleas to prioritise procedural labour related human rights to face the WTO impact generally | 201 |
| 6.2.2. What's in a name? Guarding and respecting balances inherent in 'human rights' law in the context of WTO law | 207 |
| 6.2.2.1. Resisting pleas to reinforce the weight of economic considerations in human rights law through extending 'the human rights' list by adding economic market freedoms | 208 |
| 6.2.2.2. Resisting arguments to prioritise human rights of economic operators | 219 |
| 6.2.3. <i>It's (also) the economy, stupid!</i> Overcoming the 'economic(s) deficit' in human rights scholarship's dominant conception of 'human rights' | 221 |
| 6.3. Understanding and overcoming methodological barriers: learning lessons from European Court of Justice case-law balancing human rights and economic market freedoms | 228 |
| 6.3.1. The implications of qualifying measures aimed at protecting human rights as 'discriminatory' 'trade barriers' | 232 |
| 6.3.2. The need for a trade court's 'substantive engagement' with human rights law and principles when invoked by States | 235 |
| 6.4. Understanding and overcoming institutional barriers: Practical obstacles and opportunities for integrating education and culture related human rights norms into WTO case law | 241 |
| 6.4.1. Institutional barriers at the national level: The problem of 'disconnected government' | 242 |
| 6.4.2. Institutional barriers at the international level: Devices to sensitise WTO institutions to human rights concerns | 244 |
| 7. General conclusion: the need for reframing 'human rights and trade' | 247 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 271 |