Contents

Foreword ..... *vii*
Preface ..... *ix*
About the Author ..... *xi*
Table of Cases ..... *xvii*
Table of Statutes ..... *xix*
Subject Index ..... *xxi*

The Development of Medical Negligence Law in Malaysia 1960's – 2009

Introduction 1
Medical negligence litigation in Malaysia 2
Problems with the tort system 3
  Adversarial in nature 3
  The lengthy period in pursuing a claim 3
  Effect of a medical negligence claim on the defendant doctor 4
  Rise in medical insurance premium rates 5
  Defensive medicine 5
  Accountability 5
  Deterrence 6
  Compensation 6
  The substantive law 7
Changing paradigms of Malaysian medical jurisprudence 7
Background of the *Bolam* principle 8
Why the excessive judicial deference to medical opinion? 10
  Reluctance in making findings of negligence against members of any honourable profession 10
  Difficulties in setting the standard, breach of duty to be judged by peers. 11
  Presumption of beneficence 11
Reinterpretation of the *Bolam* principle: *Bolitho v City & Hackney Health Authority* 11
Burying *Bolam* down under 12
Departing from *Bolam*'s progeny, *Sidaway*: The case of *Chester v Afshar* 15
The development of the *Bolam* principle in Malaysia 16
The departures from the normal interpretation of the *Bolam* principle 22
Bolam principle in the Federal Court 24
Implications of the Federal Court ruling 25
  Escalating claims in future? 25
  Abandonment was only restricted to doctor's duty to disclose risks 26

Rogers did not deny the relevance of medical opinion but only denied its conclusiveness 26
Significance of the application of *Bolitho v City & Hackney Health Authority* 27
Patient autonomy triumphing over medical paternalism: Boon or bane? 27
Conclusion: Creating awareness about legal issues amongst the medical professionals 28
References 29

Cases up to 1969 31

Chin Keow v Government of Malaysia [1967] 2 MLJ 45 44
Government of Malaysia & Anor v Chin Keow [1965] 2 MLJ 91 41
Ong Bak Hin v General Medical Council [1956] 1 MLJ 117 35
Ong Hin Wah v Dental Board, Federation of Malaya [1953] 1 MLJ 248 33
Public Prosecutor v GJN D'Fonseka, Dr [1958] 1 MLJ 102 37
Swamy v Matthews & Anor [1967] 1 MLJ 142 46

Cases from 1970 to 1979 49

Ang Tiong Seng v Goh Huan Chir [1970] 2 MLJ 271 53
Elizabeth Choo v Government of Malaysia [1970] 2 MLJ 171 55
Velupillai v Government of Malaysia & Anor [1970] 2 MLJ 63 51

Cases from 1980 to 1989 59

Kathavarayan v Ng Sup Moi & Anor [1987] 1 MLJ 246 73
Kow Nan Seng v Nagamah & Ors [1982] 1 MLJ 128 65
Wan Norsiah binti Wan Abdullah v Che Harun bin Che Daud [1980] 1 MLJ 237 61
Wong Choon Mei & Anor v Kuldeep Singh, Dr & Ano [1985] 2 MLJ 373 70
Yahaya bin Mat & Anor v Abdul Rahman bin Abu [1983] 1 MLJ 302 68
Yoong Leok Kee Corporation Sdn Bhd v Chin Thong Thai [1981] 2 MLJ 21 63

Cases from 1990 to 1999 77

Abdul Rahman bin Abdul Karim v Abdul Wahab bin Abdul Hamid [1996] 4 MLJ 623 98
Chelliah a/l Manickam & Anor v Kerajaan Malaysia [1997] 2 AMR 1856; [1997] 5 CLJ 78 107
Chew Swee Hiang v Attorney General of Singapore & Anor [1991] 1 MLJ 284 82
Chin Yoon Hiap, Dr v Ng Eu Khoon & Ors and Other Appeals [1997] 4 AMR 4204; [1998] 1 MLJ 57 113
Chua Kaw Bing, Dr v Majlis Perubatan Malaysia [1997] 5 MLJ 596 105
Foo Fio Na v Hospital Assunta & Anor [1999] 4 AMR 4494; [1999] 6 MLJ 738 126

Hong Chuan Lay v Eddie Soo Fook Mun, Dr [1998] 3 AMR 2301; [1998] 7 MLJ 481 120
Inderjeet Singh a/l Piara Singh v Mazlan bin Jasman & Ors [1995] 3 AMR 2201; [1995] 2 MLJ 646 92
Kamalam a/p Raman & Ors v Eastern Plantation Agency (Johore) Sdn Bhd Ulu Tiram Estate, Ulu Tiram, Johore & Anor [1996] 4 MLJ 674 102
Liau Mui Mui v R Venkat Krishnan, Dr [1998] 4 AMR 3850; [1999] 1 CLJ 207 123
Liew Sin Kiong v Sharon DM Paulraj, Dr [1996] 2 AMR 1403; [1996] 5 MLJ 193 95
Mariah bte Mohamad (Administratrix of the Estate of Wan Salleh bin Wan Ibrahim, Deceased) v Abdullah bin Daud (Lim Kok Eng, Dr & Anor, Third Parties) [1990] 1 MLJ 240 79
Mohan Rajadurai v Majlis Perubatan Malaysia [1998] 1 CLJ 903 116
Ng Eu Khoon v Gwen Smith & Ors, Dr [1991] 1 LNS 442 85
Tan Ah Kau v Government of Malaysia [1997] 2 AMR 1382 111
Wang Hsiuh Ling v Peter Ng & Anor, Dr [1991] 2 CLJ 1613 88
Wong Wai Ping, Dr & Anor v Woon Lin Sing & Ors [1999] 2 AMR 1693; [1999] 6 CLJ 23 130

Cases from 2000 to present 135

Asiah Kamsah v Rajinder Singh, Dr & Ors [2001] 4 CLJ 269 162
Chien Tham Kong v Excellent Strategy Sdn Bhd & Ors [2009] 7 MLJ 261 198
Dea Ai Eng v Dr Wong Seak Shoon & Anor [2007] 7 CLJ 337 188
Faridah Ariffin v Lee Hock Bee, Dr & Anor [2006] 1 AMR 377; [2006] 1 CLJ 660 171
Foo Fio Na v Soo Fook Mun, Dr & Ors [2002] 2 AMR 1524; [2002] 2 MLJ 129 149
Foong Yeen Keng v Assunta Hospital (M) Sdn Bhd & Anor [2006] 2 AMR 324; [2006] 1 CLJ 608 179
Hassan Datolah v Kerajaan Malaysia [2003] 5 CLJ 355 153
Hong Chuan Lay v Dr Eddie Soo Fook Mun [2006] 2 AMR 394; [2006] 2 MLJ 218 159
Hor Sai Hong & Anor v University Hospital & Anor [2002] 5 MLJ 167 151
Ismail Abdullah, Dr v Poh Hui Lin (Administrator for the Estate of Tan Amoi @ Ong Ah Mauy, Deceased) [2009] 7 AMR 277; [2009] 2 MLJ 599 195
Jayadevan Arayan, Dr & Anor v Sharon Simon & Ors [2000] 2 AMR 2428; [2000] 3 CLJ 647 137
K Anandaraj a/l Krishnasamy v Vijayasingam, Dato' Dr & Anor [2005] 6 AMR 264; [2005] 7 MLJ 120 160
Krishnan Nambiar a/l G Perabakaran (A minor suing through G Perabakaran a/l Govindan) & Ors v P Mahendran, Dr & Anor [2004] 5 MLJ 77 157
KS Sivananthan, Dr v Government of Malaysia, The & Anor [2000] 4 AMR 3767; [2001] 1 MLJ 35 139

Lechemanavasagar a/l S Karuppiah v Thomas Yau Pak Chenk, Dr & Anor [2008] 1 AMR 833; [2008] 1 MLJ 115 191
Payremalu a/l Veerappan v Amarjeet Kaur, Dr & Ors [2001] 3 AMR 3305; [2001] 3 MLJ 725 145
Pritam Singh, Dr v Yap Hong Choon [2006] 6 AMR 633; [2006] 4 CLJ 759 186
Soo Fook Mun, Dr v Foo Fio Na & Anor (and Another Appeal) [2001] 2 AMR 2205; [2001] 2 MLJ 193 142
Tan Eng Siew & Anor v Jagjit Singh Sidhu, Dr & Anor [2006] 1 MLJ 57 175
Udhaya Kumar a/l Karuppusamy & Anor v Penguasa Hospital Daerah Pontian & Ors [2004] 2 MLJ 661 165
Yap Hong Choon v Pritam Singh, Dr [2006] 2 AMR 535; [2006] 1 CLJ 842 182