The Neuroscience of Language
On Brain Circuits of Words
and Serial Order

FRIEDEMANN PULVERMÜLLER
Cognition and Brain Sciences Unit
Medical Research Council

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Preface page xi

1 A Guide to the Book 1
   1.1 Structure and Function of the Book 1
   1.2 Paths Through the Book 2
   1.3 Chapter Overview 4
      1.3.1 Chapter 1: A Guide to the Book 4
      1.3.2 Chapter 2: Neuronal Structure and Function 4
      1.3.3 Chapter 3: From Aphasia Research to Neuroimaging 4
      1.3.4 Chapter 4: Words in the Brain 4
      1.3.5 Excursus E1: Explaining Neuropsychological Double Dissociations 5
      1.3.6 Chapter 5: Regulation, Overlap, and Web Tails 5
      1.3.7 Chapter 6: Neural Algorithms and Neural Networks 5
      1.3.8 Chapter 7: Basic Syntax 5
      1.3.9 Chapter 8: Synfire Chains as the Basis of Serial Order in the Brain 6
      1.3.10 Chapter 9: Sequence Detectors 6
      1.3.11 Chapter 10: Neuronal Grammar 6
      1.3.12 Chapter 11: Neuronal Grammar and Algorithms 6
      1.3.13 Excursus E2: Basic Bits of Neuronal Grammar 7
      1.3.14 Excursus E3: A Web Response to a Sentence 7
      1.3.15 Chapter 12: Refining Neuronal Grammar 7
      1.3.16 Excursus E4: Multiple Reverberation for Resolving Lexical Ambiguity 7
      1.3.17 Excursus E5: Multiple Reverberations and Multiple Center Embeddings 7
# Contents

1.3.18 Chapter 13: Neurophysiology of Syntax 8
1.3.19 Chapter 14: Linguistics and the Brain 8

## 2 Neuronal Structure and Function

2.1 Neuronal Structure 10
  2.1.1 Anatomy of a Nerve Cell 10
  2.1.2 Basics of the Cortex 13
  2.1.3 Internal Wiring of the Cortex 16
2.2 Neuronal Function and Learning 18
2.3 Principles and Implications 20
2.4 Functional Webs in the Cortex 22
  2.4.1 Why Numerous Neurons Should Cooperate 22
  2.4.2 The Need for Connecting Neurons in Distant Cortical Areas 23
2.5 Defining Functional Webs 24
2.6 Evidence for Functional Webs 26
2.7 A View of Cortical Function 28
2.8 Temporal Dynamics in Functional Webs: Ignition and Reverberation 29

## 3 From Classic Aphasia Research to Modern Neuroimaging

3.1 Aphasiology 33
3.2 Laterality of Language 39
3.3 Neuroimaging of Language 44
3.4 Summary 48

## 4 Words in the Brain

4.1 Word-Form Webs 50
4.2 Category-Specific Word Webs 56
  4.2.1 Visually Related and Action Words 56
  4.2.2 Sub-types of Action Words 62
4.3 The Time Course of Lexical and Semantic Activation 62
4.4 Summary and Conclusions 64

## Excursus E1: Explaining Neuropsychological Double Dissociations

E1.2 Broca’s vs. Wernicke’s Aphasias 69
Contents

5 Regulation, Overlap, and Web Tails 74
  5.1 Regulation of Cortical Activity 75
    5.1.1 The Overactivation Problem in Autoassociative Memories 75
    5.1.2 Coincidence vs. Correlation 76
    5.1.3 Sparse Coding 76
    5.1.4 A Cybernetic Model of Feedback Regulation of Cortical Activity 78
    5.1.5 Striatal Regulation of Cortical Activity 80
    5.1.6 Summary 81
  5.2 Overlapping Representations 82
    5.2.1 Homophones and Form-Related Words 83
    5.2.2 Synonyms 87
    5.2.3 Prototypes and Family Resemblance 88
  5.3 Web Tails 91
    5.3.1 Affective and Emotional Meaning 91
    5.3.2 Linking Phonological, Orthographical, and Meaning-Related Information 91
  5.4 Summary 95

6 Neural Algorithms and Neural Networks 96
  6.1 McCulloch and Pitts’s Logical Calculus as a Starting Point 97
  6.2 Symbolic Connectionist Models of Language 107
  6.3 Distributed Connectionist Models of Language 112
  6.4 Hot Topics in Neural Network Research on Language 115
    6.4.1 Word Category Deficits 115
    6.4.2 The Development of Rules in the Brain 119

7 Basic Syntax 124
  7.1 Rewriting Rules 125
  7.2 Center Embedding 128
  7.3 Discontinuous Constituents and Distributed Words 134
  7.4 Defining Word Categories in Terms of Complements: Dependency Syntax 139
  7.5 Syntactic Trees 141
  7.6 Questions for a Neuronal Grammar 144

8 Synfire Chains as the Basis of Serial Order in the Brain 147
  8.1 Neurophysiological Evidence and Neuronal Models 147
  8.2 A Putative Basis of Phonological Processing 151
  8.3 Can Synfire Chains Realize Grammar? 154
  8.4 Functional Webs Composed of Synfire Chains 156
  8.5 Summary 158
9 Sequence Detectors
9.1 Movement Detection 159
9.2 Sequence Detectors for Word Strings 161
9.3 Sequence Detectors and Syntactic Structure 163

10 Neuronal Grammar
10.1 The Story So Far 169
10.2 Neuronal Sets 169
10.3 Threshold Control 175
10.4 Sequence Detection in Networks of Neuronal Sets 177
10.5 Activity Dynamics of Sequence Detection 181
10.6 Lexical Categories Represented in Neuronal Sets 186
  10.6.1 Why Lexical Categories? 186
  10.6.2 Lexical Ambiguity 187
  10.6.3 Lexical Categories as Sets of Sequence Sets 190
  10.6.4 Neuronal Requirements of a Grammar Machine 192
  10.6.5 Lexical Disambiguation by Sequence Sets 194
10.7 Summary: Principles of Neuronal Grammar 200

11 Neuronal Grammar and Algorithms
11.1 Regular Associations, Associative Rules 207
11.2 A Formalism for Grammar Networks 209
11.3 Some Differences Between Abstract and Neuronal Grammar 211
11.4 Summary 214

Excursus E2: Basic Bits of Neuronal Grammar 215
  E2.1 Examples, Algorithms, and Networks 215
  E2.2 Grammar Circuits at Work 217
    E2.2.1 Simulation 1: Acceptance of a Congruent String 219
    E2.2.2 Simulation 2: Processing of an Incongruent String 220
    E2.2.3 Simulation 3: Processing of a Partly Congruent String 222

Excursus E3: A Web Response to a Sentence 224
  E3.1 The Grammar Algorithm and Network 225
  E3.2 Sentence Processing in Syntactic Circuits 227
    E3.2.1 Global Characteristics 228
    E3.2.2 Specific Features 231
  E3.3 Discussion of the Implementation and Simulation 232

12 Refining Neuronal Grammar 235
12.1 Complements and Adjuncts 236
12.2 Multiple Activity States of a Neuronal Set 238
  12.2.1 The Concept of Multiple Reverberation 239
CHAPTER ONE

A Guide to the Book

The neuroscience of language is a multidisciplinary field. The reader’s primary interest may therefore lie in various classical disciplines, including psychology, neuroscience, neurology, linguistics, computational modeling, or even philosophy. Because readers with different backgrounds may be interested in different parts of this book, Chapter 1, Section 1.3 gives an overview of the book contents and the gist of each chapter. In Section 1.1, the general structure of the book is explained; subsequently, paths through the book are recommended for readers with different backgrounds and interests in Section 1.2.

1.1 Structure and Function of the Book

The fourteen chapters of this book are mainly designed to convey one single message: It is a good idea to think about language in terms of brain mechanisms – to spell out language in the language of neurons, so to speak. Making this point is not a new proposal. One can find similar statements in classical writings; for example, in Freud’s monograph on aphasia (Freud, 1891) and other publications by neurologists in the late nineteenth century, and, of course, in modern brain-theoretical and linguistic publications (Braitenberg, 1980; Mesulam, 1990; Schnelle, 1996a). However, a systematic model of language at the level of neurons as to date is not available, at least, not an approach that would be both grounded in empirical research while at the same time attacking a wide range of complex linguistic phenomena.

Apart from the main message, this book puts forward two principle proposals: First, that words are represented and processed in the brain by strongly connected distributed neuron populations exhibiting specific topographies. These neuron ensembles are called word webs. Second, that
A Guide to the Book

Grammar mechanisms in the brain can be thought of in terms of neuronal assemblies whose activity specifically relates to the serial activation of pairs of other neuron ensembles. These assemblies are called sequence sets. The proposal about word webs is presented in Chapter 4 and the one about sequence sets in Chapter 10. One may therefore consider Chapters 4 and 10 the core chapters of this book.

As it happens, new proposals elicit discussion, which, in turn, makes refinement of the original proposals desirable. The word web proposal is being refined in Chapters 5 and 8, and the proposal on grammar mechanisms is further developed in Chapters 11 and 12. As stressed in the Preface, several colleagues contributed to the refinements offered. The evolution of some of the ideas is documented in a recent discussion in the journal *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (Pulvermüller, 1999b). Summaries of ideas put forward here can be found in related review papers (Pulvermüller, 2001, 2002).

Apart from presenting the two main proposals, the book is designed to give the reader an introduction to basic knowledge from disciplines relevant in the cognitive neuroscience of language. Chapter 2 offers an introduction to neuroscience and cognitive brain processes. Chapter 3 introduces basics about classical aphasia research and modern neuroimaging of language. Two more introductory chapters follow approximately in the middle of the book. Chapter 6 features neural network approaches to language, and Chapter 7 introduces basics of syntactic theories. These introductory chapters were written to make the book “self-contained,” so that ideally speaking no prior special knowledge would be required to understand it.

Interspersed between the chapters are five excursuses, labeled E1 through E5, which illustrate the functioning of brain models of language. In each excursus, one or more simple simulations are summarized that address an issue raised in the preceding chapter. Computer simulations of the main syndromes of aphasia (Excursus E1) are included along with simulations of the processing of simple (Excursus E2) and gradually more complex (Excursuses E3–E5) sentences in brain models of grammar. Some of the simulations are available as animations accessible through the Internet.

1.2 Paths Through the Book

Clearly, the reader can choose to read through the book from beginning to end. However, because not all issues covered by the book may be in the inner circle of one’s personal “hot topics,” it may be advantageous to have available alternatives to this global strategy. One alternative would be to take a glance at the main chapters (4 and 10) or at the introductory chapter concerning the topic one is particularly keen on. However, one may
1.2 Paths Through the Book

Table 1.1. Routes through the book recommended to readers primarily interested in neuroscience, linguistics, or neuronal modeling, respectively. Chapter numbers and headings are indicated. Headings are sometimes abbreviated. Excursuses are referred to by the letter E plus a number and by abbreviated headings. For further explanation, see text.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Neuroscience Route</th>
<th>Linguistics Route</th>
<th>Modeling Route</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 Neuronal structure and function</td>
<td>4 Words in the brain</td>
<td>4 Words in the brain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Aphasia and neuroimaging</td>
<td>7 Basic syntax</td>
<td>5 Regulation, overlap, web tails</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Regulation, overlap, web tails</td>
<td>8 Synfire chains</td>
<td>6 Neural networks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Synfire chains</td>
<td>9 Sequence detectors</td>
<td>10 Neuronal grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Sequence detectors</td>
<td>11 Neuronal grammar and algorithms</td>
<td>E1 Double dissociations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Neurophysiology of syntax</td>
<td>12 Refining neuronal grammar</td>
<td>E2 Basic bits of neuronal grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Linguistics and the brain</td>
<td></td>
<td>E3 Web response to a sentence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Linguistics and the brain</td>
<td></td>
<td>E4 Lexical ambiguity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>E5 Center embedding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

wish to dive deeper into the matter while still primarily following one’s interests.

For this latter purpose, three paths through the book are offered for a reader primarily interested in neuroscience, linguistics, and neurocomputational modeling. If one chooses one of these options, one should be aware that the routes are not self-contained and consultation of other chapters may be relevant occasionally. To facilitate detection of relevant information in other chapters of the book, multiple cross-references have been added throughout.

The three paths through the book are presented in Table 1.1. Please consult the overview, Section 1.3, for details about chapter contents.

It is difficult to decide what to recommend to a reader primarily interested in psychology. Because psychology is a rather wide field, the best recommendation may depend primarily on the subdiscipline of interest. Readers interested in neuropsychology and psychophysiology can be recommended to follow the neuroscience route, whereas those interested in cognitive psychology may tend more toward modeling aspects. The neuroscience route would also be recommended to the reader focusing on neuroimaging or neurology. A philosopher may be most interested in the open questions that accumulate in Chapters 5, 12, and 14.
A Guide to the Book

1.3 Chapter Overview

1.3.1 Chapter 1: A Guide to the Book

The main purpose of the book and its structure are explained briefly. Recommendations are given concerning how to use the book if one is interested primarily in its neuroscience, linguistics, or modeling aspects. The gist of each book chapter is summarized briefly.

1.3.2 Chapter 2: Neuronal Structure and Function

Chapter 2 introduces basics about the anatomy and function of the neuron and the cortex. Principles of cortical structure and function are proposed that may be used as a guideline in cognitive brain research. The concept of a distributed functional system of nerve cells, called functional web, is introduced and discussed in the light of neurophysiological evidence.

1.3.3 Chapter 3: From Aphasia Research to Neuroimaging

Basics about aphasia, language disorders caused by disease of the adult brain, are summarized. Aphasia types and possibilities on explaining some of their aspects are being discussed. The issue of the laterality of language to the dominant hemisphere – usually the left hemisphere – is mentioned, and theories of laterality and interhemispheric interaction are covered. Basic insights in the functional architecture of the cortex as revealed by modern neuroimaging techniques are also in the focus. The conclusion is that some, but not all, insights from classical aphasia research about the localization of cortical language functions can be confirmed by neuroimaging research. However, language processes seem to be much more widely distributed than previously assumed. The question about the cortical locus of word semantics, as such, has found contradicting answers in recent imaging research.

1.3.4 Chapter 4: Words in the Brain

The proposal that words are cortically represented and processed by distributed functional webs of neurons is elaborated and discussed on the basis of recent neuroimaging studies. The data support the postulate that words and concepts are laid down cortically as distributed neuron webs with different topographies. The strongly connected distributed neuron ensembles representing words are labeled word webs. Word webs may consist of a phonological part (mainly housed in the language areas) and a semantic part
1.3 Chapter Overview

(involving other areas as well). For example, processing of words with strong associations to actions and that of words with strong visual associations appears to activate distinct sets of brain areas. Also, different subcategories of action words have been found to elicit differential brain responses. This supports the proposed model.

1.3.5 Excursus E1: Explaining Neuropsychological Double Dissociations

A simulation is presented that allows for the explanation of neuropsychological double dissociations on the basis of distributed functional webs of neurons. The nonlinear decline of performance of the models with lesion size and its putative neurological relevance are also mentioned.

1.3.6 Chapter 5: Regulation, Overlap, and Web Tails

Chapter 5 deals with open issues remaining from earlier chapters. How could a regulation device controlling activity in the cortex be organized? How would words with similar meaning but different form, or words with similar form but different meaning, be realized in the brain? Would the brain’s word processor be restricted to the cortex, or can word webs have subcortical “tails”? One postulate is that multiple overlap between cortical representations exists between word representations.

1.3.7 Chapter 6: Neural Algorithms and Neural Networks

An introduction into neural network models is given. McCulloch and Pitt’s theory is sketched and perceptron-based simulations are featured. Symbolic connectionist approaches are also discussed briefly. Among the hot topics featured are the explanation of word category deficits as seen in neurological patients and the development of rules in infants’ brains.

1.3.8 Chapter 7: Basic Syntax

A few terms and theoretical approaches to syntax are introduced. Phrase structure grammars, dependency grammars, and more modern proposals rooted in these classic approaches are discussed. Syntactic problems such as those associated with long-distance dependencies and center embeddings are mentioned. Chapter 7 ends with a list of issues with which grammar circuits should cope.
Chapter 8: Synfire Chains as the Basis of Serial Order in the Brain

One type of serial-order mechanism in the brain for which there is evidence from neurophysiological research is featured. Called a synfire chain, it consists of local groups of cortical neurons connected in sequence, with loops also allowed for (reverberatory synfire chain). The synfire model of serial order is found to be useful in modeling phonological–phonetic processes. It is argued, however, that a synfire model of syntax does not appear to be fruitful.

Chapter 9: Sequence Detectors

A second type of serial-order mechanism exists for which there is evidence from brain research. It is the detection of a sequence of neuron activations by a third neuronal element called the sequence detector. The evidence for sequence detectors comes from various brain structures in various creatures. It is argued that sequence detectors may operate on sequences of activations of word webs, and that these may be part of the grammar machinery in the brain.

Chapter 10: Neuronal Grammar

Neuronal sets are defined as functional webs with four possible activity states: inactivity (O), full activation or ignition (I), sustained activity or reverberation (R) and neighbor-induced preactivity or priming (P). Reverberation and priming levels can vary. Grammar networks are proposed to be made up of two types of neuronal sets: word webs and sequence sets. Sequence sets respond specifically to word sequences. The lexical category of words and morphemes is represented by a set of sequence sets connected directly to word webs. Words that can be classified as members of different lexical categories have several mutually exclusive sets of sequence sets. Activity dynamics in the network are defined by a set of principles. A grammar network, also called neuronal grammar, can accept strings of words or morphemes occurring in the input, including sentences with long-distance dependencies. The hierarchical relationship between sentence parts becomes visible in the activation and deactivation sequence caused by an input string.

Chapter 11: Neuronal Grammar and Algorithms

Three types of formulas are introduced that describe a neuronal grammar network:
1.3 Chapter Overview

1. Assignment formulas are definitions of connections between input units and lexical category representations and are analogous to lexicon or assignment rules of traditional grammars.

2. Valence formulas are definitions of lexical categories in terms of sequencing units and have some similarity to dependency rules included in dependency grammars.

3. Sequence formulas are definitions of connections between sequencing units and have no obvious counterpart in traditional grammars.

1.3.13 Excursus E2: Basic Bits of Neuronal Grammar

Simple word strings are discussed on the basis of grammar networks composed of sequence sets and word webs. How the network accepts a string and how the network behaves if it fails to do so is discussed.

1.3.14 Excursus E3: A Web Response to a Sentence

Processing of an ordinary sentence is simulated in a neuronal grammar architecture. The sentence exhibits six morphemes, subject–verb agreement, a distributed word, and other interesting properties.

1.3.15 Chapter 12: Refining Neuronal Grammar

A revision of the grammar model is proposed that requires stronger assumptions. The core assumption is that neuronal sets exhibit multiple states of reverberation and priming. In the new architecture, the relationship between words and lexical categories is now dynamic.

1.3.16 Excursus E4: Multiple Reverberation for Resolving Lexical Ambiguity

Implementation of multiple lexical category representations of words using mutually exclusive sets of sequence sets allows for modeling sentences in which the same word form is being used twice, as a member of different lexical categories.

1.3.17 Excursus E5: Multiple Reverberations and Multiple Center Embeddings

A network with dynamic binding between word and lexical category representations and the option to activate each neuronal set is introduced on the
A Guide to the Book

background of the machinery discussed in Chapters 10 and 11. This more advanced architecture now models the processing of grammatically complex sentences that include center embeddings.

1.3.18 Chapter 13: Neurophysiology of Syntax

Grammatically incorrect “sentences” elicit specific physiological brain responses. Two such physiological indicators of grammatical deviance are discussed. The neuronal grammar proposal is related to these data, and a putative neurobiological explanation for them is offered.

1.3.19 Chapter 14: Linguistics and the Brain

Linguistics and brain science must merge. This is reemphasized in Chapter 14 where putative advantages of a brain-based language theory are highlighted.